# THE CHECKERBOARD CHALLENGE

Akritee Shrestha Hamilton College '13 HRUMC 2013







> The main diagonal of the grid contains no coins



The main diagonal of the grid contains no coins

> The arrangement of the coins is diagonally symmetric

# THE CHALLENGE



Cover *n* columns, n < 9 such that an even number of coins remains visible in each row.

# THE CHALLENGE



Cover *n* columns, n < 9 such that an even number of coins remains visible in each row.





















# THE SOLUTION!!!



## EXISTENCE: DOES A SOLUTION EXIST FOR EVERY 'CHECKERBOARD'?







 $= \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$ 

A =

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

 $A_j$  -  $j^{
m th}$  column of the matrix A

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

 $A_j$  -  $j^{
m th}$  column of the matrix A

$$A_2 + A_4 + A_6 + A_7 + A_8 + A_9 =$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} 2\\4\\4\\2\\4\\4\\2\\2\\2\end{bmatrix}$$

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

 $A_j$  -  $j^{
m th}$  column of the matrix A

$$A_{2} + A_{4} + A_{6} + A_{7} + A_{8} + A_{9} = \begin{bmatrix} 2\\4\\4\\4\\2\\4\\4\\2\\2 \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{or} \quad A \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\0\\1\\0\\1\\1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} =$$

 $\frac{2}{2}$ 

 $\mathbf{2}$ 

4

4

4

244

 $\frac{2}{2}$ 

or

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

 $A_j$  -  $j^{\mathrm{th}}$  column of the matrix A

$$A_2 + A_4 + A_6 + A_7 + A_8 + A_9 =$$

 $A \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ 

solution matrix





 $A_j$  -  $j^{
m th}$  column of the matrix A

$$A_{2} + A_{4} + A_{6} + A_{7} + A_{8} + A_{9} = \begin{bmatrix} 2\\4\\4\\4\\2\\4\\4\\2\\2 \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{or} \quad A \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\0\\1\\0\\1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2\\4\\4\\4\\2\\2\\2 \end{bmatrix}$$









 $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$  is the smallest finite field consisting of two elements 0 and 1.

By modular arithmetic, for all integers z $z \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ , if z is even  $z \equiv 1 \pmod{2}$ , if z is odd







AX = 0

AX = 0

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

AX = 0



AX = 0

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \\ x_3 \\ x_4 \\ x_5 \\ x_6 \\ x_7 \\ x_8 \\ x_9 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

 $x_1 = 0, x_2 = 1, x_3 = 0, x_4 = 1, x_5 = 0, x_6 = 1, x_7 = 1, x_8 = 1, x_9 = 1$ 



AX = 0

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \\ x_3 \\ x_4 \\ x_5 \\ x_6 \\ x_7 \\ x_8 \\ x_9 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

 $x_1 = 0, x_2 = 1, x_3 = 0, x_4 = 1, x_5 = 0, x_6 = 1, x_7 = 1, x_8 = 1, x_9 = 1$ 



AX = 0



 $x_1 = 0, x_2 = 1, x_3 = 0, x_4 = 1, x_5 = 0, x_6 = 1, x_7 = 1, x_8 = 1, x_9 = 1$ 



## EXISTENCE THEOREM

**Definition:** Let *m* be an odd number. Over the field  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ , a **checkerboard matrix** is an *m* × *m* symmetric matrix with diagonal elements equal to 0.

#### EXISTENCE THEOREM

**Definition:** Let *m* be an odd number. Over the field  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ , a **checkerboard matrix** is an *m* × *m* symmetric matrix with diagonal elements equal to 0.

**Terminology:** An **elementary product** of an  $m \times m$  matrix is a product of m elements of the matrix such that the each element in the product is located on a unique row i and a unique column j, where  $0 \le i, j \le m$ . The set of ordered pairs (i, j) is the corresponding **transversal**.

## EXISTENCE THEOREM

**Definition:** Let *m* be an odd number. Over the field  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ , a **checkerboard matrix** is an *m* × *m* symmetric matrix with diagonal elements equal to 0.

**Terminology:** An **elementary product** of an  $m \times m$  matrix is a product of m elements of the matrix such that the each element in the product is located on a unique row i and a unique column j, where  $0 \le i, j \le m$ . The set of ordered pairs (i, j) is the corresponding **transversal**.

**Theorem:** A checkerboard matrix has a non-trivial nullspace.

Let A be an  $m \times m$  checkerboard matrix. We want to show: det(A) = 0 over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ .

Let A be an  $m \times m$  checkerboard matrix.

We want to show: det(A) = 0 over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ .

Det(A) is an alternating sum of elementary products of A.

Since we are working over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ , +1 = -1.

Det(A) is just an ordinary sum of the elementary products of A. An  $m \times m$  matrix has m! elementary products.

Let A be an  $m \times m$  checkerboard matrix.

We want to show: det(A) = 0 over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ .

Det(A) is an alternating sum of elementary products of A.

Since we are working over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ , +1 = -1.

Det(A) is just an ordinary sum of the elementary products of A.

An  $m \times m$  matrix has m! elementary products.

We want to show that the sum of these *m*! elementary products is 0.

We want to show that the sum of these m! elementary products is 0.

- We want to show that the sum of these m! elementary products is 0.
- <u>Case I:</u> If a transversal contains an ordered pair (i, i), i.e it represents a diagonal element, the corresponding elementary product is equal to 0.

# We want to show that the sum of these m! elementary products is 0.

<u>Case I:</u> If a transversal contains an ordered pair (i, i), i.e it represents a diagonal element, the corresponding elementary product is equal to 0.

<u>Case II:</u> If a transversal represents no diagonal element, it will have a 'mirror image' obtained by reflection across the diagonal.

# We want to show that the sum of these m! elementary products is 0.

<u>Case I:</u> If a transversal contains an ordered pair (i, i), i.e it represents a diagonal element, the corresponding elementary product is equal to 0.

<u>Case II:</u> If a transversal represents no diagonal element, it will have a 'mirror image' obtained by reflection across the diagonal.

Since each elementary product consists of an odd number of elements, each transversal is distinct from its mirror image.

# We want to show that the sum of these m! elementary products is 0.

<u>Case I:</u> If a transversal contains an ordered pair (i, i), i.e it represents a diagonal element, the corresponding elementary product is equal to 0.

<u>Case II:</u> If a transversal represents no diagonal element, it will have a 'mirror image' obtained by reflection across the diagonal.

Since each elementary product consists of an odd number of elements, each transversal is distinct from its mirror image.

Since A is symmetric, the elementary products corresponding to the the transversal and its mirror image are equal. Since we are working over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ , their sum is equal to 0.

# We want to show that the sum of these m! elementary products is 0.

<u>Case I:</u> If a transversal contains an ordered pair (i, i), i.e it represents a diagonal element, the corresponding elementary product is equal to 0.

<u>Case II:</u> If a transversal represents no diagonal element, it will have a 'mirror image' obtained by reflection across the diagonal.

Since each elementary product consists of an odd number of elements, each transversal is distinct from its mirror image.

Since A is symmetric, the elementary products corresponding to the the transversal and its mirror image are equal. Since we are working over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ , their sum is equal to 0.

So, the sum of the elementary products is 0.

Let A be an  $m \times m$  checkerboard matrix.

We want to show: det(A) = 0 over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ .

Det(A) is an alternating sum of elementary products of A.

Since we are working over  $[\mathbb{Z}]_2$ , +1 = -1.

Det(A) is just an ordinary sum of the elementary products of A.

An  $m \times m$  matrix has m! elementary products.

The sum of these *m*! elementary products is 0.

QED

## REFERENCE

#### L. Zulli, The Incredibly Knotty Checkerboard Challenge, *Mathematics Magazine* 71(1998), 378-385

# Acknowledgements

Professor Richard Bedient Hamilton College Mathematics Department Williams College







